

OXFORDSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

MINUTES of the meeting held on Tuesday, 5 November 2019 commencing at 10.30 am and finishing at 3.45 pm.

Present:

Councillor Les Sibley – in the Chair

Councillors:

John Howson	Mike Fox-Davies	Jeannette Matelot
Sobia Afridi	Stefan Gawrysiak	Charles Mathew
Jamila Begum Azad	Mark Gray	Glynis Phillips
David Bartholomew	Carmen Griffiths	Susanna Pressel
Dr Suzanne Bartington	Pete Handley	Laura Price
Tim Bearder	Jane Hanna OBE	Eddie Reeves
Maurice Billington	Jenny Hannaby	G.A. Reynolds
Liz Brighthouse OBE	Neville F. Harris	Judy Roberts
Paul Buckley	Damian Haywood	Alison Rooke
Nick Carter	Mrs Judith Heathcoat	Gill Sanders
Mark Cherry	Hilary Hibbert-Biles	John Sanders
Dr Simon Clarke	Ian Hudspeth	Roz Smith
Yvonne Constance OBE	Tony Ilott	Lawrie Stratford
Ian Corkin	Bob Johnston	Emma Turnbull
Arash Fatemian	Liz Leffman	Michael Waine
Neil Fawcett	Lorraine Lindsay-Gale	Liam Walker
Ted Fenton	Mark Lygo	Richard Webber
Nicholas Field-Johnson	D. McIlveen	
Mrs Anda Fitzgerald-O'Connor	Kieron Mallon	

The Council considered the matters, reports and recommendations contained or referred to in the agenda for the meeting and decided as set out below. Except insofar as otherwise specified, the reasons for the decisions are contained in the agenda and reports, copies of which are attached to the signed Minutes.

66/19 MINUTES

(Agenda Item 1)

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 10 September 2019 were approved and signed as an accurate record of the Meeting.

Matters Arising

In relation to Question 5 of Annex 1 to the Minutes, Councillor Webber indicated that the Leader of the Council had not given a fair reflection of the truth when he had stated that HIF 1 Bid would cease if SODC did not have a

local Plan. In response the Leader stated that it had been an accurate statement at that time and that if SODC did not have a Local Plan in place by 15 October 2019 there could be doubt over the HIF 1 Funding.

67/19 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

(Agenda Item 2)

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Hannah Banfield, Councillor Kevin Bulmer, Councillor Steve Harrod, Councillor Dan Sames, Councillor Emily Smith and Councillor Alan Thompson.

68/19 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(Agenda Item 3)

Councillor Alison Rooke declared a non-pecuniary interest in Agenda Item 14 (Motion by Councillor Eddie Reeves) by virtue of her position as Trustee/Director of Vale House Alzheimer's Home.

Councillor Jenny Hannaby declared non-pecuniary interest in Agenda Item 14 (Motion by Councillor Eddie Reeves) by virtue of her position as Chairman of the Trustees for Wantage Community Nursing Home.

69/19 OFFICIAL COMMUNICATIONS

(Agenda Item 4)

Council received the following announcements:

The Chairman reported that it had been decided, in consultation with the Group Leaders to cancel the December Meeting of Council on 10 December 2019 due to the proximity of the Meeting to the General Election. A provisional date of 14th January had been agreed for a meeting of Council, if required following the General Election. Members would be notified whether the meeting would be taking place on 20 December.

Council congratulated the Chairman on his successful Charity Dinner which had raised in excess of £3,000 for local charities.

Council noted that the Chairman would be hosting an 'Antiques Supper' at the Swan in Tetsworth on 19 November 2019. Tickets were available from the Chairman's PA.

70/19 PETITIONS AND PUBLIC ADDRESS

(Agenda Item 6)

Council received the following public address:

Mr Mike Tyso, Chipping Norton Town Council, spoke in support of Agenda Item 15 (Motion by Councillor Hilary Hibbert-Biles) on the basis that residents had petitioned for action for many years for action; that currently, the road was so narrow in places that a car and a HGV could not pass and that air pollution within the Town was well in excess international levels. He urged

the Council to Route HGVs away from the town Centre, warning that the Tank Farm development could increase traffic by 50%.

Mr Church spoke in support of Question 7 on Notice by Councillor Suzanne Bartington in relation to the benefits of tree planting. He urged the Council to adopt a tree planting Policy and to create good quality green spaces with careful, well planned tree planting which could see Oxfordshire safe and clean by 2040 based on 3 major reports that suggested tree planting on a large scale could combat greenhouse gases.

100,000s of people were concerned about Climate Change, and whilst he acknowledged that tree planting would not resolve Climate Change, it would go a long way towards it.

Mr David Gilmour, CPRE Oxfordshire, spoke in support of Agenda Item 13 (Motion by Councillor John Sanders on the Expressway) on the basis that the Expressway would transform large parts of the County forever; there would be a huge loss of habitats and that the investment should be made in the north instead. He questioned how the Council could support a scheme of such increased car use having declared a 'Climate Emergency' and urged the Council to reject the Expressway.

71/19 QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE FROM MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL

(Agenda Item 8)

24 Questions with notice were asked. Details of the questions and answers and the supplementary questions and answers (where asked) are set out in Annex 1 to the Minutes.

In relation to Question 1 of the report (Question from Councillor Leffman to Councillor Gray) Councillor Gray undertook to investigate what was happening around community transport in Charlbury and provide Councillor Leffman with a written response. Councillor Grey urged all members to contact the newly formed Community Transport and Concessionary Fares team for any help with providing community transport.

In relation to Question 2 of the report (Question from Councillor Cherry to Councillor Constance) Councillor Constance indicated that she was hoping to bring forward the programme for replacing street lighting with LED in the Ruscote area of Banbury.

In relation to Question 5 of the report (Question from Councillor Roberts to Councillor Constance) Councillor Constance undertook to provide Councillor Roberts with a written answer as to whether, given the seriousness of the accident on the Eynsham Road, there had been any progress on sourcing funds from Highways England that OCC were signposted to?

In relation to Question 7 of the report (Question from Councillor Bartington to Councillor Constance) Councillor Constance undertook to investigate a 'partnership initiative with the Council's partners - Parish, Town, District

Councils and other stakeholders - to introduce a replacement initiative, such that each time a tree was removed, another planted (potentially including handover of maintenance responsibilities).

In relation to Question 13 of the report (Question from Councillor Turnbull to Councillor Lindsay-Gale) Councillor Lindsay-Gale undertook to provide Councillor Turnbull with a written answer detailing whether any of the young people identified as waiting for a place in the written answer, were Looked After Children or qualified for Free School Meals or Pupil Premium, and if so, how many.

In relation to Question 14 of the report (Question from Councillor Turnbull to Councillor Lindsay-Gale) Councillor Lindsay-Gale undertook to provide Councillor Turnbull with a written answer detailing the outcomes of when Fair Access Panels met.

In relation to Question 23 of the report (Question from Councillor Phillips to Councillor Harrod) Councillor Hudspeth undertook to ask Councillor Harrod to provide a written answer detailing how many assessments were waiting to be undertaken under section 17 ZA Children's Act 1989, together with the associated waiting times.

72/19 REPORT OF THE CABINET

(Agenda Item 9)

The Council received the report of the Cabinet.

In relation to paragraph 2 of the report (HIF Marginal Viability (mv) Funding Agreements Bicester & Wantage) (Question from Councillor Hannaby to Councillor Hudspeth) Councillor Hudspeth undertook to look into when the final contracts would be signed so that work could commence; and to put as much pressure on the process as possible.

In relation to paragraph 7 of the report (The Oxfordshire Safeguarding Children's Board Annual Report/The Performance Audit & Quality Assurance Annual Report and The Case Review & Governance Annual Report - 2019) (Question from Councillor Hanna to Councillor Harrod) Councillor Hudspeth undertook to ask Councillor Harrod to provide a written answer detailing what could be done to increase the awareness of all local practitioners, especially in schools, of the trends outlined in the report and recommendations (particularly exclusion rates of children with SEND and LAC) and what was being done to tackle recruitment and retention of key personnel working with children.

In relation to paragraph 9 of the report (Implementation of a Street Works Permit Scheme for Oxfordshire) (Question from Councillor Buckley to Councillor Constance) Councillor Constance gave an assurance that conditions would be attached to the future Street Works Permits, so that issues such as delays, due to traffic light operation could be avoided.

However, Councillor Constance pointed that foresight into issues that could arise was often difficult.

In relation to paragraph 11 of the report (Oxfordshire Minerals and Waste Local Plan: Site Allocations – Consultation Draft Plan) (Question from Councillor J. Sanders to Councillor Constance) Councillor Constance undertook to make every endeavour to ensure that the new timetable for delivery of Core Strategy part 2 would be delivered on its present schedule and that officers would receive as much support as they required.

In relation to paragraph 11 of the report (Oxfordshire Minerals and Waste Local Plan: Site Allocations – Consultation Draft Plan) (Question from Councillor Johnston to Councillor Constance) Councillor Constance undertook to consider employing additional consultants (if required) to deliver the Site Allocations Plan by November 2020.

In relation to paragraph 13 of the report (Capital Finance Monitoring Report) (Question from Councillor Roz Smith to Councillor Bartholomew) Councillor Bartholomew undertook to provide Councillor Roz Smith with a written answer detailing how the urgent repairs to Windmill School were to be funded; and whether it would be from the contingency budget or capital school's maintenance budget.

73/19 COMMITTEE DATES

(Agenda Item 10)

At the Annual Council Meeting in May this year it had been suggested in error and agreed that the Annual Meeting in 2020 be held on 12 May 2020. Under the rules of the Constitution, the meeting should be held on the third Tuesday in May and it was therefore suggested that it be held on 19 May.

RESOLVED: (nem con) to agree the above change to the Annual Council Meeting to 19 May 2020.

74/19 THE LEADER'S UPDATE ON THE MOTION ON CLIMATE ACTION

(Agenda Item 11)

At its Meeting on 2 April 2019, Council approved a motion in the following terms:

The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) in their October report stated that if the planet wants to avert dangerous climate breakdown, we need to cut emissions in half by 2030, and hit zero by the middle of the century.

Oxfordshire is already doing its bit: we are committed to reducing emissions from our own estate and activities by 3% a year. Unfortunately, our current plans are not enough. The IPCC's report suggests that the world has just a dozen years left to restrict global warming to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels. Should they increase by 2°C, humanity's capacity to prevent

catastrophic food shortages, floods, droughts, extreme heat and poverty will be severely impaired. Limiting Global Warming to 1.5°C may still be possible, but only with ambitious action from national and sub-national authorities, civil society, the private sector, indigenous peoples and local communities. Furthermore, bold climate action can deliver economic benefits in terms of new jobs, economic savings and market opportunities.

Oxfordshire County Council calls on the Leader to:

1. Acknowledge a 'Climate Emergency' and call for action
2. Pledge to make Oxfordshire County Council carbon neutral by 2030, taking into account both production and consumption emissions;
3. Call on Westminster to provide the powers and resources to make the 2030 target possible;
4. Continue to work with partners across the county and region to deliver this new goal through all relevant strategies;
5. Report to Council within six months with the actions the Council will take to address this emergency."

Council had before it a report which updated Council on the work undertaken since the adoption of the Motion (CC11).

Councillor Ian Hudspeth moved and Councillor Yvonne Constance seconded that the recommendations set out in the report and on the face of the Agenda be approved.

During debate it was suggested and agreed that the Leader's speech be copied to all parish, district and county councillors. Following debate the motion was put to the vote and it was:-

RESOLVED: (nem con) to note the update from the Leader on the action taken in pursuant to the Motion in April 2019 on Climate action and to note process for taking the further recommendations forward.

The Leaders update is attached at to the signed copy of the minutes.

75/19 MOTION BY COUNCILLOR RICHARD WEBBER

(Agenda Item 12)

Councillor Webber moved and Councillor Leffman seconded the following Motion:

"Whilst the process of Transformation will almost certainly lead to improvements and efficiencies in the way the Council operates, the primary driver for undertaking the Transformation Program was the need to save £15m in order to balance the budget.

To date, a number of costs have already been incurred (mostly additional staffing costs to make sure that Transformation happens). Given that there are areas of the Council where Officer shortages are already affecting our

ability to deliver services as efficiently and speedily as we would wish, it is important that these areas are protected from any further staff reductions.

Some savings have already been claimed. But the communication of this information to Members has been disjointed and confusing. As a result, Members have no means of measuring or judging what success the Program may be having. Given the overriding importance of Transformation in delivering the necessary financial benefits, it is vital that all Members are able to judge its success effectively and in a timely manner.

The practice (to date) of burying the costs and the savings in many different lines of the budget makes it impossible to monitor and scrutinize the process with rigour.

Therefore, this Council requests Council Finance Officers to include in the forthcoming budget papers a separate report on Transformation to include identifying and quantifying for all years of the Program 2018/19-2022/2023 the following:

1. The costs actually incurred and predicted (including staffing redundancy and pension costs)
2. The savings actually achieved and predicted.”

Following debate, the Motion was put to the vote and was lost by 44 votes to 12.

76/19 MOTION BY COUNCILLOR JOHN SANDERS

(Agenda Item 13)

Councillor John Sanders moved and Councillor Liz Brighthouse seconded the following Motion:

“Given the inadequate response from the Ministry of Housing Communities and Local Government to the concern of this Council regarding the Oxford to Cambridge Expressway, this Council asks the Leader to write to the Minister of Housing, Communities and Local Government and Highways England in the following terms:

Oxfordshire County Council will work with Highways England on the development of the vision for the English Economic Heartland and the Oxford to Cambridge Arc on the understanding that they will expedite the realisation of the East West Rail Link.

The development of the railway line will ensure the delivery of the growth and housing required, without the environmental impact of a road cutting across the centre of rural England.

Building the Expressway flies in the face of Oxfordshire’s commitment to reduce the use of the car. An action which is necessary to tackle the Climate

Change Emergency, which Local Government, including Oxfordshire, has signed up to.

Oxfordshire does not support the building of the Expressway irrespective of which route is chosen.”

Councillor Tim Bearder moved and Councillor Bob Johnston seconded the following amendment to the Motion as shown in bold italics and strikethrough below:

“Given the inadequate response from the Ministry of Housing Communities and Local Government to the concern of this Council regarding the Oxford to Cambridge Expressway this Council asks the Leader to write to MHCLG and Highways England in the following terms:

Oxfordshire County Council will work with Highways England ~~on the development of the vision~~ **to create a vision** for the England Economic Heartland and the Oxford to Cambridge Arc on the understanding that they will expedite the realisation of the East West Rail Link.

The development of the railway line will ensure the delivery of ~~the sensible growth and housing required~~ **to meet local need**. ~~Without the environmental impact of a road cutting across the centre of rural England.~~

Building the Expressway **and a million associated houses** flies in the face of Oxfordshire’s commitment to reduce the use of the car. An action which is necessary to tackle the Climate Change Emergency which Local Government, including Oxfordshire, has signed up to.

Oxfordshire does not support the building of the Expressway irrespective of which route is chosen **or the planned rate of house building, which would see the numbers of houses in the county double in size over the next 30 years and cause untold environmental harm.**”

Following debate, the amendment was put to the vote and was lost by 45 votes to 11.

The substantive vote was then put to the vote and was carried by 36 votes to 11, with 8 abstentions.

RESOLVED: (36 votes to 11, 8 abstentions)

Given the inadequate response from the Ministry of Housing Communities and Local Government to the concern of this Council regarding the Oxford to Cambridge Expressway, this Council asks the Leader to write to the Minister of Housing, Communities and Local Government and Highways England in the following terms:

Oxfordshire County Council will work with Highways England on the development of the vision for the English Economic Heartland and the

Oxford to Cambridge Arc on the understanding that they will expedite the realisation of the East West Rail Link.

The development of the railway line will ensure the delivery of the growth and housing required, without the environmental impact of a road cutting across the centre of rural England.

Building the Expressway flies in the face of Oxfordshire's commitment to reduce the use of the car. An action which is necessary to tackle the Climate Change Emergency, which Local Government, including Oxfordshire, has signed up to.

Oxfordshire does not support the building of the Expressway irrespective of which route is chosen.

77/19 MOTION BY COUNCILLOR EDDIE REEVES

(Agenda Item 14)

Councillor Eddie Reeves moved and Councillor Mallon seconded the following Motion:

"This Council deplores the Oxfordshire Clinical Commissioning Group's ('CCG') decision on 26 September to establish a midwife led unit for the foreseeable future at the Horton General Hospital.

The decision follows public consultation and evidence-gathering exercises in which neither the public, nor this Council, have confidence. Public trust in the CCG and in Oxfordshire University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust ('OUHFT') was damaged when the temporary downgrade was enforced, without consultation, in August 2016 and has since been further eroded by the persistent lack of meaningful engagement, which speaks to their Oxford-centric agenda.

Council endorses the recent conclusions of the Horton Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee ('Horton HOSC') in bringing OUHFT and CCG shortcomings to the fore and resolves to fully support Horton HOSC's efforts to continue to hold the CCG and OUHFT to account and pursue an appropriate course of action.

This Council recognises the vital importance of the Horton General Hospital in providing first-class care to patients across Oxfordshire, Northamptonshire and Warwickshire and welcomes the commitment from OUHFT and the CCG to invest significantly in the Horton site.

After years of talk and hollow promises, now is the time for action and that commitment needs to be tangibly demonstrated. Council also notes the pledge of OUHFT and the CCG to "regularly review" the viability of reinstating an obstetric-led maternity unit in Banbury. The real-life birthing experiences of local mothers cannot continue to be overlooked and Council will do all it can to ensure their voices are heard."

Councillor Tim Bearder moved and Councillor Jenny Hannaby seconded the following amendment as set out below in bold italics and Strikethrough:

“This Council deplores the Oxfordshire Clinical Commissioning Group’s (‘CCG’) decision on 26 September to ~~establish~~ ***to downgrade services to a midwife-only*** led unit for the foreseeable future at the Horton General Hospital

The decision follows public consultation and evidence-gathering exercises in which neither the public, nor this Council, have confidence. Public trust in the CCG and in Oxfordshire University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust (‘OUHFT’) was damaged when the temporary downgrade was enforced, without consultation, in August 2016 and has since been further eroded by the persistent lack of meaningful engagement, which speaks to their Oxford-centric agenda.

Council endorses the recent conclusions of the Horton Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee (‘Horton HOSC’) in bringing OUHFT and CCG shortcomings to the fore and resolves to fully support Horton HOSC’s efforts to continue to hold the CCG and OUHFT to account and pursue an appropriate course of action.

This Council recognises the vital importance of the Horton General Hospital in providing first-class care to patients across Oxfordshire, Northamptonshire and Warwickshire and welcomes the commitment from OUHFT and the CCG to invest significantly in the Horton site.

~~After years of talk and hollow promises, now is the time for a~~***Action*** ~~and that commitment~~***is now*** ~~needed. to be tangibly demonstrated.~~ Council also notes the pledge of OUHFT and the CCG to “regularly review” the viability of reinstating an obstetric-led maternity unit in Banbury. The real-life birthing experiences of local mothers cannot continue to be overlooked and Council will do all it can to ensure their voices are heard.***calls on the Leader to write to the SoS for Health to ask him or her to provide funding to support the hospital so this decision can be reversed.***

The amendment was put to the vote and was lost by 30 votes to 21, with 2 abstentions.

During debate, Councillor Carter moved and Councillor Brighthouse seconded a procedural motion under the Council Procedure Rules (15.11) of the Constitution “that the question be now put”. The motion was put to the vote and is was:-

RESOLVED: (by 40 votes to 10) that the question be now put.

The substantive Motion was then put to the vote and was carried by 52 votes to 0, with 1 abstention.

RESOLVED: (by 52 votes to 0, with 1 abstention)

This Council deplores the Oxfordshire Clinical Commissioning Group's ('CCG') decision on 26 September to establish a midwife led unit for the foreseeable future at the Horton General Hospital.

The decision follows public consultation and evidence-gathering exercises in which neither the public, nor this Council, have confidence. Public trust in the CCG and in Oxfordshire University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust ('OUHFT') was damaged when the temporary downgrade was enforced, without consultation, in August 2016 and has since been further eroded by the persistent lack of meaningful engagement, which speaks to their Oxford-centric agenda.

Council endorses the recent conclusions of the Horton Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee ('Horton HOSC') in bringing OUHFT and CCG shortcomings to the fore and resolves to fully support Horton HOSC's efforts to continue to hold the CCG and OUHFT to account and pursue an appropriate course of action.

This Council recognises the vital importance of the Horton General Hospital in providing first-class care to patients across Oxfordshire, Northamptonshire and Warwickshire and welcomes the commitment from OUHFT and the CCG to invest significantly in the Horton site.

After years of talk and hollow promises, now is the time for action and that commitment needs to be tangibly demonstrated. Council also notes the pledge of OUHFT and the CCG to "regularly review" the viability of reinstating an obstetric-led maternity unit in Banbury. The real-life birthing experiences of local mothers cannot continue to be overlooked and Council will do all it can to ensure their voices are heard.

78/19 MOTION BY COUNCILLOR HILARY HIBBERT-BILES

(Agenda Item 15)

Councillor Hilary Hibbert-Biles moved and Councillor George Reynolds seconded the following Motion:

"This Council has recognised and accepted the serious issues facing Chipping Norton given inclusion in LTP's as far back as 2004. The biggest issue in Chipping Norton is the amount of HGV's accessing the High Street in the town.

It is now accepted by Public Health England, that Air pollution damages health and can be responsible for deaths. Chipping Norton has been an AQMA since 2006. Air Quality continues to be over EU acceptable limits and one of the highest in Oxfordshire. There is also a safety issue where two A roads merge into a narrow road unable to take an HGV and a car travelling in the other direction and narrow pavements. There have been 2 deaths and a serious accident in recent years.

HGV's affect listed buildings and residents. There has been little or no action by OCC.

The majority of land at Tank Farm is OCC owned. Given this, there will be a large receipt from development which could be used towards a weight limit and lorry route.

This Council requests the Cabinet to face up to the health and safety issues of residents of Chipping Norton and act on the previous LTP2 and LTP3 recommendations for a weight limit or indeed a lorry route.”

Following debate, the Motion was put to the vote and was carried unanimously (45 votes to 0).

RESOLVED: accordingly.

79/19 MOTIONS BY COUNCILLOR NEVILLE HARRIS, JANE HANNA AND YVONNE CONSTANCE.

(Agenda Item 16)

The time being after 3.30 pm, these Motions were considered dropped in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 15.1.

..... in the Chair

Date of signing